

NORTH ATLANTIC TREATY ORGANIZATION



RESEARCH AND TECHNOLOGY ORGANIZATION

BP 25, 7 RUE ANCELLE, F-92201 NEUILLY-SUR-SEINE CEDEX, FRANCE

RTO MEETING PROCEEDINGS 36

# Structural Aspects of Flexible Aircraft Control

(les Aspects structuraux du contrôle actif et flexible des aéronefs)

*Papers presented at the Specialists' Meeting of the RTO Applied Vehicle Technology Panel (AVT) held in Ottawa, Canada, 18-20 October 1999.*



Published May 2000

*Distribution and Availability on Back Cover*

**This page has been deliberately left blank**



**Page intentionnellement blanche**

**NORTH ATLANTIC TREATY ORGANIZATION**



**RESEARCH AND TECHNOLOGY ORGANIZATION**

BP 25, 7 RUE ANCELLE, F-92201 NEUILLY-SUR-SEINE CEDEX, FRANCE

---

**RTO MEETING PROCEEDINGS 36**

## **Structural Aspects of Flexible Aircraft Control**

(les Aspects structuraux du contrôle actif et flexible des aéronefs)

*Papers presented at the Specialists' Meeting of the RTO Applied Vehicle Technology Panel (AVT)  
held in Ottawa, Canada, 18-20 October 1999.*



# The Research and Technology Organization (RTO) of NATO

RTO is the single focus in NATO for Defence Research and Technology activities. Its mission is to conduct and promote cooperative research and information exchange. The objective is to support the development and effective use of national defence research and technology and to meet the military needs of the Alliance, to maintain a technological lead, and to provide advice to NATO and national decision makers. The RTO performs its mission with the support of an extensive network of national experts. It also ensures effective coordination with other NATO bodies involved in R&T activities.

RTO reports both to the Military Committee of NATO and to the Conference of National Armament Directors. It comprises a Research and Technology Board (RTB) as the highest level of national representation and the Research and Technology Agency (RTA), a dedicated staff with its headquarters in Neuilly, near Paris, France. In order to facilitate contacts with the military users and other NATO activities, a small part of the RTA staff is located in NATO Headquarters in Brussels. The Brussels staff also coordinates RTO's cooperation with nations in Middle and Eastern Europe, to which RTO attaches particular importance especially as working together in the field of research is one of the more promising areas of initial cooperation.

The total spectrum of R&T activities is covered by 7 Panels, dealing with:

- SAS Studies, Analysis and Simulation
- SCI Systems Concepts and Integration
- SET Sensors and Electronics Technology
- IST Information Systems Technology
- AVT Applied Vehicle Technology
- HFM Human Factors and Medicine
- MSG Modelling and Simulation

These Panels are made up of national representatives as well as generally recognised 'world class' scientists. The Panels also provide a communication link to military users and other NATO bodies. RTO's scientific and technological work is carried out by Technical Teams, created for specific activities and with a specific duration. Such Technical Teams can organise workshops, symposia, field trials, lecture series and training courses. An important function of these Technical Teams is to ensure the continuity of the expert networks.

RTO builds upon earlier cooperation in defence research and technology as set-up under the Advisory Group for Aerospace Research and Development (AGARD) and the Defence Research Group (DRG). AGARD and the DRG share common roots in that they were both established at the initiative of Dr Theodore von Kármán, a leading aerospace scientist, who early on recognised the importance of scientific support for the Allied Armed Forces. RTO is capitalising on these common roots in order to provide the Alliance and the NATO nations with a strong scientific and technological basis that will guarantee a solid base for the future.

The content of this publication has been reproduced directly from material supplied by RTO or the authors.

Published May 2000

Copyright © RTO/NATO 2000  
All Rights Reserved

ISBN 92-837-0014-7



*Printed by Canada Communication Group Inc.  
(A St. Joseph Corporation Company)  
45 Sacré-Cœur Blvd., Hull (Québec), Canada K1A 0S7*

# **Structural Aspects of Flexible Aircraft Control**

**(RTO MP-36)**

## **Executive Summary**

The papers presented at this meeting dealt with the state-of-the-art, underlying theory of the influencing factors and characteristics, and existing capabilities of Nations to integrate various factors during the design stage while observing the effects on aircraft layout and behaviour.

Aircraft are inherently flexible and flexibility can be used to advantage as a design feature for improved performance. Flexible aircraft are subject to interaction between flight mechanics, structural dynamics, and flight control system dynamics. Aeroservoelastic instability can lead to disastrous failures in aircraft as was recently the case for several fighter aircraft. These problems are very similar to flutter accidents which occurred two decades ago. Limit cycle oscillations could restrict fighter aircraft performance particularly those with various store configurations. This problem is most relevant to air-to-ground attack and fighter aircraft.

Flight control systems increasing the stability, or the active control of low damped or unstable aircraft with rigid or flexible modes, have additional coupling effects on flight mechanics and structural responses. These interactions must be considered when designing the airframe structure, flight control systems, and elastic alleviation systems in order to avoid bad handling qualities and bad ride comfort.

An integral analysis of flight mechanics, flight control, static and dynamic loads, flutter and aeroservoelasticity has to be carried out. Therefore, a compatible mathematical model of the coupled dynamics of flight mechanics, flight control, and structural dynamics must be established. Such models (using the time and frequency domain descriptions) are available in the military aircraft industry to assist in the design and clearance of flight control systems. However, the design of flight control systems and structures is usually performed separately. As such, an integrated interdisciplinary design of flight control systems is generally not feasible due to its complexity. At present, it is only used to improve the control system and the structural capability of components in critical areas.

How to improve the design methods used in the development of military fighter aircraft, and its use in transport aircraft design applications was an outcome of this meeting.

# **les Aspects structuraux du contrôle actif et flexible des aéronefs**

**(RTO MP-36)**

## **Synthèse**

Les communications présentées lors de cette réunion ont examiné l'état actuel des connaissances dans ce domaine, les théories régissant les facteurs déterminants et les caractéristiques et les capacités actuelles des pays membres de l'OTAN à incorporer ces différents facteurs dans le processus de conception, ainsi que les effets sur la configuration et le comportement des aéronefs.

Les aéronefs sont intrinsèquement flexibles et cette flexibilité peut être mise à profit au stade de la conception pour améliorer leurs performances. Les aéronefs flexibles sont sujets à des interactions entre la mécanique du vol, la dynamique structurale et la dynamique des systèmes de pilotage. L'instabilité aéroserveoélastique peut conduire à une défaillance catastrophique de l'avion, comme il a été démontré récemment pour plusieurs avions de combat. Ces problèmes ressemblent aux accidents dûs au flottement, survenus il y a deux décennies. Il se peut que le rayon d'action des avions de combat soit limité par les oscillations limites, et surtout dans le cas de certaines configurations d'emports. Ce problème affecte particulièrement les avions de combat d'attaque au sol.

Les systèmes de pilotage privilégiant l'augmentation de la stabilité, ou le contrôle actif d'aéronefs instables ou aux oscillations faiblement amorties ayant des modes rigides ou flexibles peuvent créer des effets de couplage supplémentaires affectant la mécanique du vol et les réponses structurales. Ces interactions doivent être prises en compte lors de la conception de la cellule, des systèmes de commande de vol et des systèmes d'allègement élastique afin d'éviter la détérioration des qualités de vol et du confort du pilote.

Il y a lieu de procéder à une analyse intégrale de la mécanique du vol, des systèmes de pilotage, des charges statiques et dynamiques, du flottement et de l'aéroserveoélasticité. Il est, par conséquent, nécessaire d'établir un modèle mathématique compatible de la dynamique couplée de la mécanique du vol, des systèmes de pilotage et de la dynamique structurale. De tels modèles (qui intègrent la description du domaine du temps et du domaine de fréquence), sont à la disposition de l'industrie aéronautique militaire pour la conception et l'homologation des systèmes de pilotage. Cependant, les systèmes de commande de vol et les structures sont, en principe, conçus séparément. Par conséquent, la conception interdisciplinaire intégrée des systèmes de commande de vol n'est en général guère faisable en raison de sa complexité. A l'heure actuelle, cette approche est utilisée uniquement pour améliorer le système de commande et la capacité structurale de certains composants critiques.

Les conclusions de cette réunion permettent d'envisager l'amélioration des méthodes de conception mises en œuvre dans le développement des avions de combat et de les appliquer à la conception des avions de transport militaires.

# Contents

|                                                                                                                                                                     | Page             |
|---------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|------------------|
| <b>Executive Summary</b>                                                                                                                                            | <b>iii</b>       |
| <b>Synthèse</b>                                                                                                                                                     | <b>iv</b>        |
| <b>Theme/Thème</b>                                                                                                                                                  | <b>viii</b>      |
| <b>Publications of the RTO Applied Vehicle Technology Panel</b>                                                                                                     | <b>ix</b>        |
| <b>Specialists' Meeting Programme Committee</b>                                                                                                                     | <b>xi</b>        |
|                                                                                                                                                                     | <b>Reference</b> |
| <b>Technical Evaluation Report</b><br>by T.A. Weisshaar                                                                                                             | <b>T</b>         |
| <b>General Keynote</b><br>by T.A. Weisshaar                                                                                                                         | <b>K</b>         |
| <b>SESSION I: AEROSERVOELASTICITY</b>                                                                                                                               |                  |
| <b>A Unique Design for a Diverging Flexible Vertical Tail</b><br>by O. Sensburg, G. Schneider, V. Tischler and V. Venkayya                                          | <b>1</b>         |
| <b>F-22 Structural Coupling Lessons Learned</b><br>by W.R. Wray, Jr.                                                                                                | <b>2</b>         |
| <b>Aeroservoelastic Modeling, Analysis, and Design Techniques for Transport Aircraft</b><br>by M.L. Baker, P.J. Goggin and B.A. Winther                             | <b>3</b>         |
| <b>The Interaction of Flight Control System and Aircraft Structure</b><br>by J. Becker, B. Caldwell and V. Vaccaro                                                  | <b>4</b>         |
| <b>Ground Structural Coupling Testing and Model Updating in the Aeroservoelastic Qualification of a Combat Aircraft</b><br>by V. Vaccaro, B. Caldwell and J. Becker | <b>5</b>         |
| <b>Unified Flight Mechanics and Aeroelasticity for Accelerating, Maneuvering, Flexible Aircraft</b><br>by J.J. Olsen                                                | <b>6</b>         |
| <b>An Integrated Design Procedure for Aircraft Structure Including the Influence of Flight Control System on Aircraft Flutter</b><br>by W. Lubert and J. Becker     | <b>7</b>         |
| <b>Characterisation of Nonlinear Aeroservoelastic Behaviour</b><br>by G. Dimitriadis and J.E. Cooper                                                                | <b>8</b>         |

|                                                                                                                                                                                                                                        |          |
|----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|----------|
| <b>Méthode de calcul du flutter en présence de jeu mécanique et vérification expérimentale<br/>(Flutter Analysis Method in Presence of Mechanical Play and Experimental Verification)</b><br>by C. Petiau, B. Journee and E. Garrigues | <b>9</b> |
|----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|----------|

## **SESSION II: ACTIVE CONTROL OF FLEXIBLE STRUCTURE I**

|                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                          |              |
|------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|--------------|
| <b>An Integrated Process for Design and Validation of Flight Control Laws of Flexible Aircraft Structure</b><br>by M. Lacabanne and M. Humbert                                                                                                                                           | <b>9 bis</b> |
| <b>The Impact of Active Aeroelastic Wing Technology on Conceptual Aircraft Design</b><br>by P.M. Flick and M.H. Love                                                                                                                                                                     | <b>10</b>    |
| <b>Active Aeroelastic Aircraft and its Impact on Structure and Flight Control Systems Design</b><br>by J. Schweiger and J. Krammer                                                                                                                                                       | <b>11</b>    |
| <b>Aeroservoelastic Characteristics of the B-2 Bomber and Implications for Future Large Aircraft</b><br>by R.T. Britt, J.A. Volk, D.R. Dreim and K.A. Applewhite                                                                                                                         | <b>12</b>    |
| <b>Research Activities within NASA's Morphing Program</b><br>by A-M.R. McGowan, L.G. Horta, J.S. Harrison and D.L. Raney                                                                                                                                                                 | <b>13</b>    |
| <b>Design Aspects of the Elastic Trailing Edge for an Adaptive Wing</b><br>by H.P. Monner, D. Sachau and E. Breitbach                                                                                                                                                                    | <b>14</b>    |
| <b>NASA Langley Research Center's Contributions to International Active Buffeting Alleviation Programs</b><br>by R.W. Moses                                                                                                                                                              | <b>15</b>    |
| <b>Méthode d'identification des forces aérodynamiques instationnaires sur les essais en vol, validation expérimentale<br/>(Method of Mathematical Identification of Unsteady Airloads from Flight Measurements, Experimental Validation)</b><br>by C. Petiau, E. Garrigues and Ph. Nicot | <b>16</b>    |
| <b>Passenger Comfort Improvement by Integrated Control Law Design</b><br>by F. Kubica and B. Madelaine                                                                                                                                                                                   | <b>17</b>    |

## **SESSION III: ACTIVE CONTROL OF FLEXIBLE STRUCTURE II**

|                                                                                                                                                                                |           |
|--------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|-----------|
| <b>Integrated Flight Mechanic and Aeroelastic Modelling and Control of a Flexible Aircraft Considering Multidimensional Gust Input</b><br>by P. Teufel, M. Hanel and K.H. Well | <b>18</b> |
| <b>Integral Control of Large Flexible Aircraft</b><br>by K. König and J. Schuler                                                                                               | <b>19</b> |
| <b>Design of Control Laws for Alleviation of Ground - Induced Vibrations</b><br>by W.R. Krüger and W. Kortüm                                                                   | <b>20</b> |
| <b>Non Linear Effects of Applied Loads and Large Deformations on Aircraft Normal Modes</b><br>by M. Oliver, H. Climent and F. Rosich                                           | <b>21</b> |

|                                                                                                                                                                                                                                    |            |
|------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|------------|
| <b>Flight Simulation Within the Frame of Multidisciplinary Optimization of Large Flexible Aircraft</b><br>by A. Rommel                                                                                                             | <b>22</b>  |
| <b>Mobility Analysis of a Heavy Off-Road Vehicle Using a Controlled Suspension</b><br>by M. Hönlinger and U. Glauch                                                                                                                | <b>23</b>  |
| <b>Aeroelastic Methods for Flexible Aircraft Including Flight Control System on Wing/Store Flutter and Dynamic Loads</b><br>by. J. Meijer                                                                                          | <b>24†</b> |
| <b>An Integrated Methodology for Flexible Aircraft Control Design</b><br>(Une méthodologie globale de conception de lois de commande pour l'avion souple)<br>by D. Alazard, A. Bucharles, G. Ferreres, J.F. Magni and S. Prudhomme | <b>25</b>  |

---

† Paper not available at time of printing.

# Theme

Aircraft are inherently flexible and flexibility can be used to advantage as a design feature for improved performance. Aeroservoelastic instability can also lead to a catastrophic failure of the aircraft as was shown lately on a F117 stealth aircraft accident similar to flutter accidents two decades ago. Limit cycle oscillations may placard fighter airplanes especially with various store configurations. This is most true to military transport and fighter aircraft. Flexible aircraft are subject to interactions between flight mechanics, structural dynamics and flight control system dynamics. The Meeting will look into the state of the art treating as well the underlying theory of the influencing factors and characteristics as also the existing capabilities of Nations for integrating the various factors in the design stage and the effects on aircraft layout and behaviour.

Flight control systems for the augmentation of stability or for the active control of low damped or unstable aircraft with rigid or flexible modes have additional coupling effects on flight mechanics and structural responses. These interactions have to be taken into consideration for the design of the airframe structure, flight control system and elastic alleviation systems in order to avoid bad handling qualities as well as bad ride comfort.

An integral analysis of flight mechanics, flight control, static and dynamic loads, flutter and aero-servo-elasticity has to be carried out. Therefore, a compatible mathematical model of the coupled dynamics of flight mechanics, flight control, and structural dynamics must be established. Such models (using the time and frequency domain description) are available in the military aircraft industry to assist in the design and clearance of flight control systems. However, the design of flight control systems and structures is in principle performed separately and integrated interdisciplinary design of flight control systems is in general not yet feasible due to its complexity. At present, it is used only to improve the control system and the structural capability of components in critical areas.

How the design methods used in the development of military fighter aircraft can be improved, and applied to transport aircraft design applications will be an outcome of this meeting.

# Thème

Les aéronefs sont par nature flexibles et cette flexibilité peut être mise à profit au stade de la conception pour améliorer les performances. L'instabilité aéroserveélastique peut également conduire à une défaillance catastrophique de l'avion, comme il a été démontré récemment par l'accident du bombardier furtif F117, qui ressemble aux accidents dûs au flottement, survenus il y a deux décennies. Il se peut que le rayon d'action des avions de combat soit limité par les oscillations limites, et surtout dans le cas de certaines configurations d'emports. Ces phénomènes affectent particulièrement les avions de combat et de transport militaires. En raison de leur flexibilité, ces aéronefs sont sujets à des interactions entre la mécanique du vol, la dynamique structurale et la dynamique des systèmes de commande de vol. La réunion examinera l'état actuel des connaissances dans ce domaine, et traitera également des théories régissant les facteurs déterminants et les caractéristiques. Elle étudiera également les capacités actuelles des pays membres de l'OTAN à incorporer ces différents facteurs dans le processus de conception, ainsi que les effets sur la configuration et le comportement des aéronefs.

Les systèmes de commande de vol privilégiant soit l'augmentation de la stabilité, soit le contrôle actif d'aéronefs instables ou aux oscillations faiblement amorties ayant des modes rigides ou flexibles, peuvent créer des effets de couplage supplémentaires affectant la mécanique du vol et les réponses structurales. Ces interactions doivent être prises en compte lors de la conception de la cellule, des systèmes de commande de vol et des systèmes d'allègement élastique afin d'éviter la détérioration des qualités de vol et du confort du pilote.

Il y a lieu de procéder à une analyse intégrale de la mécanique du vol, des systèmes de pilotage, des charges statiques et dynamiques, du flottement et de l'aéroserveélasticité. Il est, par conséquent, nécessaire d'établir un modèle mathématique compatible de la dynamique couplée de la mécanique du vol, des systèmes de commande de vol et de la dynamique structurale. De tels modèles (qui intègrent la description du domaine du temps et du domaine de fréquence), sont à la disposition de l'industrie aéronautique militaire pour la conception et l'homologation des systèmes de commande de vol. Cependant, les systèmes de commande de vol et les structures sont, en principe, conçus séparément, et la conception interdisciplinaire intégrée des systèmes de commande de vol n'est guère encore faisable en raison de sa complexité. A l'heure actuelle, cette approche est utilisée uniquement pour améliorer le système de commande et la capacité structurale de certains composants critiques.

Les conclusions de cette réunion devraient permettre d'améliorer les méthodes de conception mises en œuvre dans le développement des avions de combat et de les appliquer à la conception des avions de transport militaires.

# **Publications of the RTO Applied Vehicle Technology Panel**

## **MEETING PROCEEDINGS (MP)**

### **Design for Low Cost Operation and Support**

MP-37, Spring 2000

### **Structural Aspects of Flexible Aircraft Control**

MP-36, May 2000

### **Aerodynamic Design and Optimization of Flight Vehicles in a Concurrent Multi-Disciplinary Environment**

MP-35, Spring 2000

### **Gas Turbine Operation and Technology for Land, Sea and Air Propulsion and Power Systems (Unclassified)**

MP-34, Spring 2000

### **New Metallic Materials for the Structure of Aging Aircraft**

MP-25, April 2000

### **Small Rocket Motors and Gas Generators for Land, Sea and Air Launched Weapons Systems**

MP-23, April 2000

### **Application of Damage Tolerance Principles for Improved Airworthiness of Rotorcraft**

MP-24, January 2000

### **Gas Turbine Engine Combustion, Emissions and Alternative Fuels**

MP-14, June 1999

### **Fatigue in the Presence of Corrosion**

MP-18, March 1999

### **Qualification of Life Extension Schemes for Engine Components**

MP-17, March 1999

### **Fluid Dynamics Problems of Vehicles Operation Near or in the Air-Sea Interface**

MP-15, February 1999

### **Design Principles and Methods for Aircraft Gas Turbine Engines**

MP-8, February 1999

### **Airframe Inspection Reliability under Field/Depot Conditions**

MP-10, November 1998

### **Intelligent Processing of High Performance Materials**

MP-9, November 1998

### **Exploitation of Structural Loads/Health Data for Reduced Cycle Costs**

MP-7, November 1998

### **Missile Aerodynamics**

MP-5, November 1998

## **EDUCATIONAL NOTES**

### **Measurement Techniques for High Enthalpy and Plasma Flows**

EN-8, April 2000

### **Development and Operation of UAVs for Military and Civil Applications**

EN-9, April 2000

### **Planar Optical Measurements Methods for Gas Turbine Engine Life**

EN-6, September 1999

### **High Order Methods for Computational Physics (published jointly with Springer-Verlag, Germany)**

EN-5, March 1999

### **Fluid Dynamics Research on Supersonic Aircraft**

EN-4, November 1998

### **Integrated Multidisciplinary Design of High Pressure Multistage Compressor Systems**

EN-1, September 1998

## **TECHNICAL REPORTS**

**Recommended Practices for Monitoring Gas Turbine Engine Life Consumption**

TR-28, April 2000

**Verification and Validation Data for Computational Unsteady Aerodynamics**

TR-26, Spring 2000

**A Feasibility Study of Collaborative Multi-facility Windtunnel Testing for CFD Validation**

TR-27, December 1999

# Specialists' Meeting Programme Committee

## Programme Committee Chairmen

Prof.Dr. O. SENSBURG  
DaimlerChrysler Aerospace AG  
Military Aircraft MT2  
P O Box 80 11 60  
81663 Munich  
E/mail: wolfgang.luber@m.dasa.de

Mr. J. CHOPLIN  
Dassault Aviation  
Direction Générale Technique  
78, Quai Marcel Dassault, Cedex 300  
92550 Saint-Cloud  
E/M:jean.choplin@dassault.aviation.fr

### BELGIUM

Prof. Dr. Ing. J. VANTOMME  
Royal Military Academy (RMA)  
Avenue de la Renaissance, 30  
1000 Brussels

### CANADA

Mr. C. PERRON  
Bombardier Inc. Canadair  
Military Aircraft Division  
10,000 Cargo A-4 Street  
Montreal International Airport  
Mirabel, Québec I7N 1H3

### FRANCE

Mr. J. GROUAS  
Aérospatiale  
316, route de Bayonne  
31060 Toulouse Cedex  
Mr. M. LABARRERE  
ONERA/CERT/DSAC  
BP 4025  
2, Avenue Edouard Belin  
31055 Toulouse Cedex 4

### GERMANY

Dr. J. BECKER  
DaimlerChrysler Aerospace AG  
Military Aircraft MT2  
Postfach 80 11 60  
81663 Munich  
Dr. Ing. P. HAMEL  
PO Box 3267  
38022 Braunschweig  
Dr. H. HÖNLINGER  
DLR, Institut für Aeroelastik  
Bunsenstrasse 10  
D-37073 Göttingen

### ITALY

Prof. A. SALVETTI  
Universita di Pisa, Dipartimento di  
Ingegneria Aerospaziale  
Via Diotisalvi 2  
56126 Pisa

### NETHERLANDS

Ir. J. MEIJER  
National Aerospace Lab. NLR  
Dept. AE  
Anthony Fokkerweg 2  
1059 CM Amsterdam

### SPAIN

Dr. E. SANCHIZ  
Div. de Estructuras y Materiales  
Laboratorio de Diseno y Analisis  
Estructural – INTA  
Carretera Torrejon Ajalvir, Km.4  
28850 Torrejon de Ardoz (Madrid)

### TURKEY

Prof. Dr. E. SELÇUK  
Metallurgical Eng. Dept.  
Middle East Technical University  
06531 Ankara

### UNITED KINGDOM

WG CDR Chamberlain  
W.G.A.S.I., B Block, Room B009  
RAF Wyton, P.O. Box 7, Huntington  
Cambridgeshire PE17 2EA

### UNITED STATES

Mr. K.G. BHATIA  
Aeroelasticity & Multidisciplinary  
Optimization  
Boeing Company Airplane Group  
P O Box 3707 MS 6H-CJ  
Seattle, WA 98124-2207

Mr. J.A. ELLIS  
LMTAS  
P O Box 748 Mail Zone 2851  
Fort Worth, TX 76101

Dr. D. PAUL  
Chief Scientist Air Vehicles  
Air Force Research Laboratory  
AFRL/VA, Bldg 45  
2130 8<sup>th</sup> St., Suite 1  
Wright Patterson AFB, OH 45433-7542

**This page has been deliberately left blank**



**Page intentionnellement blanche**

| REPORT DOCUMENTATION PAGE                 |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                              |                                            |                                                                      |
|-------------------------------------------|------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|--------------------------------------------|----------------------------------------------------------------------|
| 1. Recipient's Reference                  | 2. Originator's References<br>RTO-MP-36<br>AC/323(AVT)TP/17                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                  | 3. Further Reference<br>ISBN 92-837-0014-7 | 4. Security Classification of Document<br>UNCLASSIFIED/<br>UNLIMITED |
| 5. Originator                             | Research and Technology Organization<br>North Atlantic Treaty Organization<br>BP 25, 7 rue Ancelle, F-92201 Neuilly-sur-Seine Cedex, France                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                  |                                            |                                                                      |
| 6. Title                                  | Structural Aspects of Flexible Aircraft Control                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                              |                                            |                                                                      |
| 7. Presented at/sponsored by              | the Specialists' Meeting of the RTO Applied Vehicle Technology Panel (AVT) held in Ottawa, Canada, 18-20 October 1999.                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                       |                                            |                                                                      |
| 8. Author(s)/Editor(s)<br>Multiple        |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                              |                                            | 9. Date<br>May 2000                                                  |
| 10. Author's/Editor's Address<br>Multiple |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                              |                                            | 11. Pages<br>298                                                     |
| 12. Distribution Statement                | There are no restrictions on the distribution of this document. Information about the availability of this and other RTO unclassified publications is given on the back cover.                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                               |                                            |                                                                      |
| 13. Keywords/Descriptors                  | <div> <div> Flight control<br/>Military aircraft<br/>Flexibility<br/>Aeroelasticity<br/>Servomechanisms<br/>Structural properties<br/>Design<br/>Static loads </div> <div> Dynamic loads<br/>Flutter<br/>Mathematical models<br/>Integrated systems<br/>Control equipment<br/>Transport aircraft<br/>Flexible structures </div> </div>                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                       |                                            |                                                                      |
| 14. Abstract                              | <p>The Specialists' Meeting dealt with Design Issues and more specifically Structural Aspects of Flexible Aircraft Control.</p> <p>Twenty six papers and a Keynote address were presented with the following objective: How the design methods used in the development of military fighter aircraft can be improved, and applied to transport aircraft design applications.</p> <p>There were three sessions covering the following topics:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>– Aeroservoelasticity</li> <li>– Active Control of Flexible Structure I</li> <li>– Active Control of Flexible Structure II</li> </ul> |                                            |                                                                      |

**This page has been deliberately left blank**



**Page intentionnellement blanche**



## RESEARCH AND TECHNOLOGY ORGANIZATION

BP 25 • 7 RUE ANCELLE

F-92201 NEUILLY-SUR-SEINE CEDEX • FRANCE

Télécopie 0(1)55.61.22.99 • E-mail mailbox@rta.nato.int

## DIFFUSION DES PUBLICATIONS

RTO NON CLASSIFIEES

L'Organisation pour la recherche et la technologie de l'OTAN (RTO), détient un stock limité de certaines de ses publications récentes, ainsi que de celles de l'ancien AGARD (Groupe consultatif pour la recherche et les réalisations aérospatiales de l'OTAN). Celles-ci pourront éventuellement être obtenues sous forme de copie papier. Pour de plus amples renseignements concernant l'achat de ces ouvrages, adressez-vous par lettre ou par télécopie à l'adresse indiquée ci-dessus. Veuillez ne pas téléphoner.

Des exemplaires supplémentaires peuvent parfois être obtenus auprès des centres nationaux de distribution indiqués ci-dessous. Si vous souhaitez recevoir toutes les publications de la RTO, ou simplement celles qui concernent certains Panels, vous pouvez demander d'être inclus sur la liste d'envoi de l'un de ces centres.

Les publications de la RTO et de l'AGARD sont en vente auprès des agences de vente indiquées ci-dessous, sous forme de photocopie ou de microfiche. Certains originaux peuvent également être obtenus auprès de CASI.

## CENTRES DE DIFFUSION NATIONAUX

## ALLEMAGNE

Streitkräfteamt / Abteilung III  
Fachinformationszentrum der  
Bundeswehr, (FIZBw)  
Friedrich-Ebert-Allee 34  
D-53113 Bonn

## BELGIQUE

Coordinateur RTO - VSL/RTO  
Etat-Major de la Force Aérienne  
Quartier Reine Elisabeth  
Rue d'Evère, B-1140 Bruxelles

## CANADA

Directeur - Recherche et développement -  
Communications et gestion de  
l'information - DRDCGI 3  
Ministère de la Défense nationale  
Ottawa, Ontario K1A 0K2

## DANEMARK

Danish Defence Research Establishment  
Ryvangs Allé 1, P.O. Box 2715  
DK-2100 Copenhagen Ø

## ESPAGNE

INTA (RTO/AGARD Publications)  
Carretera de Torrejón a Ajalvir, Pk.4  
28850 Torrejón de Ardoz - Madrid

## ETATS-UNIS

NASA Center for AeroSpace  
Information (CASI)  
Parkway Center  
7121 Standard Drive  
Hanover, MD 21076-1320

## FRANCE

O.N.E.R.A. (ISP)  
29, Avenue de la Division Leclerc  
BP 72, 92322 Châtillon Cedex

## GRECE (Correspondant)

Hellenic Ministry of National  
Defence  
Defence Industry Research &  
Technology General Directorate  
Technological R&D Directorate  
D.Soutsou 40, GR-11521, Athens

## HONGRIE

Department for Scientific  
Analysis  
Institute of Military Technology  
Ministry of Defence  
H-1525 Budapest P O Box 26

## ISLANDE

Director of Aviation  
c/o Flugrad  
Reykjavik

## ITALIE

Centro documentazione  
tecnico-scientifica della Difesa  
Via Marsala 104  
00185 Roma

## LUXEMBOURG

Voir Belgique

## NORVEGE

Norwegian Defence Research  
Establishment  
Attn: Biblioteket  
P.O. Box 25, NO-2007 Kjeller

## PAYS-BAS

NDRCC  
DGM/DWOO  
P.O. Box 20701  
2500 ES Den Haag

## POLOGNE

Chief of International Cooperation  
Division  
Research & Development Department  
218 Niepodleglosci Av.  
00-911 Warsaw

## PORTUGAL

Estado Maior da Força Aérea  
SDFA - Centro de Documentação  
Alfragide  
P-2720 Amadora

## REPUBLIQUE TCHEQUE

VTÚL a PVO Praha /  
Air Force Research Institute Prague  
Národní informační středisko  
obránného výzkumu (NISCR)  
Mladoboleslavská ul., 197 06 Praha 9

## ROYAUME-UNI

Defence Research Information Centre  
Kentigern House  
65 Brown Street  
Glasgow G2 8EX

## TURQUIE

Millî Savunma Başkanlığı (MSB)  
ARGE Dairesi Başkanlığı (MSB)  
06650 Bakanlıklar - Ankara

## AGENCES DE VENTE

NASA Center for AeroSpace  
Information (CASI)

Parkway Center  
7121 Standard Drive  
Hanover, MD 21076-1320  
Etats-Unis

The British Library Document  
Supply Centre

Boston Spa, Wetherby  
West Yorkshire LS23 7BQ  
Royaume-Uni

Canada Institute for Scientific and  
Technical Information (CISTI)

National Research Council  
Document Delivery  
Montreal Road, Building M-55  
Ottawa K1A 0S2, Canada

Les demandes de documents RTO ou AGARD doivent comporter la dénomination "RTO" ou "AGARD" selon le cas, suivie du numéro de série (par exemple AGARD-AG-315). Des informations analogues, telles que le titre et la date de publication sont souhaitables. Des références bibliographiques complètes ainsi que des résumés des publications RTO et AGARD figurent dans les journaux suivants:

## Scientific and Technical Aerospace Reports (STAR)

STAR peut être consulté en ligne au localisateur de  
ressources uniformes (URL) suivant:  
<http://www.sti.nasa.gov/Pubs/star/Star.html>  
STAR est édité par CASI dans le cadre du programme  
NASA d'information scientifique et technique (STI)  
STI Program Office, MS 157A  
NASA Langley Research Center  
Hampton, Virginia 23681-0001  
Etats-Unis

## Government Reports Announcements &amp; Index (GRA&amp;I)

publié par le National Technical Information Service  
Springfield  
Virginia 2216  
Etats-Unis  
(accessible également en mode interactif dans la base de  
données bibliographiques en ligne du NTIS, et sur CD-ROM)





## RESEARCH AND TECHNOLOGY ORGANIZATION

BP 25 • 7 RUE ANCELLE

F-92201 NEUILLY-SUR-SEINE CEDEX • FRANCE

Telefax 0(1)55.61.22.99 • E-mail mailbox@rta.nato.int

## DISTRIBUTION OF UNCLASSIFIED

## RTO PUBLICATIONS

NATO's Research and Technology Organization (RTO) holds limited quantities of some of its recent publications and those of the former AGARD (Advisory Group for Aerospace Research & Development of NATO), and these may be available for purchase in hard copy form. For more information, write or send a telefax to the address given above. **Please do not telephone.**

Further copies are sometimes available from the National Distribution Centres listed below. If you wish to receive all RTO publications, or just those relating to one or more specific RTO Panels, they may be willing to include you (or your organisation) in their distribution.

RTO and AGARD publications may be purchased from the Sales Agencies listed below, in photocopy or microfiche form. Original copies of some publications may be available from CASI.

## NATIONAL DISTRIBUTION CENTRES

## BELGIUM

Coordinateur RTO - VSL/RTO  
Etat-Major de la Force Aérienne  
Quartier Reine Elisabeth  
Rue d'Evère, B-1140 Bruxelles

## CANADA

Director Research & Development  
Communications & Information  
Management - DRDCIM 3  
Dept of National Defence  
Ottawa, Ontario K1A 0K2

## CZECH REPUBLIC

VTÚL a PVO Praha /  
Air Force Research Institute Prague  
Národní informační středisko  
obraného výzkumu (NISČR)  
Mladoboleslavská ul., 197 06 Praha 9

## DENMARK

Danish Defence Research  
Establishment  
Ryvangs Allé 1, P.O. Box 2715  
DK-2100 Copenhagen Ø

## FRANCE

O.N.E.R.A. (ISP)  
29 Avenue de la Division Leclerc  
BP 72, 92322 Châtillon Cedex

## GERMANY

Streitkräfteamt / Abteilung III  
Fachinformationszentrum der  
Bundeswehr, (FIZBw)  
Friedrich-Ebert-Allee 34  
D-53113 Bonn

## GREECE (Point of Contact)

Hellenic Ministry of National  
Defence  
Defence Industry Research &  
Technology General Directorate  
Technological R&D Directorate  
D.Soutsou 40, GR-11521, Athens

## HUNGARY

Department for Scientific  
Analysis  
Institute of Military Technology  
Ministry of Defence  
H-1525 Budapest P O Box 26

## ICELAND

Director of Aviation  
c/o Flugrad  
Reykjavik

## ITALY

Centro documentazione  
tecnico-scientifica della Difesa  
Via Marsala 104  
00185 Roma

## LUXEMBOURG

See Belgium

## NETHERLANDS

NDRCC  
DGM/DWOO  
P.O. Box 20701  
2500 ES Den Haag

## NORWAY

Norwegian Defence Research  
Establishment  
Attn: Biblioteket  
P.O. Box 25, NO-2007 Kjeller

## POLAND

Chief of International Cooperation  
Division  
Research & Development  
Department  
218 Niepodleglosci Av.  
00-911 Warsaw

## PORTUGAL

Estado Maior da Força Aérea  
SDFA - Centro de Documentação  
Alfragide  
P-2720 Amadora

## SPAIN

INTA (RTO/AGARD Publications)  
Carretera de Torrejón a Ajalvir, Pk.4  
28850 Torrejón de Ardoz - Madrid

## TURKEY

Millî Savunma Başkanlığı (MSB)  
ARGE Dairesi Başkanlığı (MSB)  
06650 Bakanlıklar - Ankara

## UNITED KINGDOM

Defence Research Information  
Centre  
Kentigern House  
65 Brown Street  
Glasgow G2 8EX

## UNITED STATES

NASA Center for AeroSpace  
Information (CASI)  
Parkway Center  
7121 Standard Drive  
Hanover, MD 21076-1320

## SALES AGENCIES

NASA Center for AeroSpace  
Information (CASI)

Parkway Center  
7121 Standard Drive  
Hanover, MD 21076-1320  
United States

The British Library Document  
Supply Centre

Boston Spa, Wetherby  
West Yorkshire LS23 7BQ  
United Kingdom

Canada Institute for Scientific and  
Technical Information (CISTI)

National Research Council  
Document Delivery  
Montreal Road, Building M-55  
Ottawa K1A 0S2, Canada

Requests for RTO or AGARD documents should include the word 'RTO' or 'AGARD', as appropriate, followed by the serial number (for example AGARD-AG-315). Collateral information such as title and publication date is desirable. Full bibliographical references and abstracts of RTO and AGARD publications are given in the following journals:

## Scientific and Technical Aerospace Reports (STAR)

STAR is available on-line at the following uniform  
resource locator:

<http://www.sti.nasa.gov/Pubs/star/Star.html>

STAR is published by CASI for the NASA Scientific  
and Technical Information (STI) Program

STI Program Office, MS 157A  
NASA Langley Research Center  
Hampton, Virginia 23681-0001  
United States

## Government Reports Announcements &amp; Index (GRA&amp;I)

published by the National Technical Information Service  
Springfield  
Virginia 22161  
United States  
(also available online in the NTIS Bibliographic  
Database or on CD-ROM)



Printed by Canada Communication Group Inc.  
(A St. Joseph Corporation Company)  
45 Sacré-Cœur Blvd., Hull (Québec), Canada K1A 0S7